

Content and Language Integrated Learning-based English Learning Material in Hindu Universities

^{1*} Ida Ayu Oka Purnami, Putu Kerti Nitiasih ², Luh Putu Artini ³, I Gede Budasi ⁴

^{1,2,3,4} Ganesha University of Education, Singaraja, Indonesia

E-mail : idaayuokapurnami@gmail.com

Abstract

This study aimed to examine the effectiveness of learning materials which was developed based on Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) approach in Hindu universities in Bali, Indonesia. The content was related to the topics of Hindu philosophy which integrate the 4 pillars in CLIL, namely Content, Cognition, Communication and Culture. This research and development study used ADDIE Model and the product was tested on 50 students enrolled in English courses in 5 Hindu Universities in Bali. Data on the product implementation were collected through test, interview, and questionnaires. Experts in material design, English lecturers, and tests on students' by implementing the product and students' feedback questionnaires. The result of t-test showed the learning material is effective in increasing student language skills. Students' responses to learning materials were in the very good category. From this study, it can be concluded that CLIL-based learning material is effective on students' language skills.

Commented [W1]: You must add more to your abstract. The abstract should summarize the problem or objective of your research, and its method, results, and conclusions. Max 250 words

Keywords: numbered head together (nht); growth mindset; scientific literacy; agile learner

Introduction

English becomes an international language that must be mastered in this globalization. English mastery covers various skills including listening, speaking, reading, and writing skills. These skills are also supported by other linguistic aspects such as vocabulary, grammar, pronunciation, and writing guidelines (Susanti, 2019). The linguistic aspects are taught integratively to reach the goal of language learning in which students utilize English communicatively (Santosa, 2017). Listening skill is determined to be a major component in language learning (Syahabuddin & Rizqa, 2021; Wulandari & Sya'ya, 2021). Lack of listening skill will impact to communication in which the message of communication cannot be received (Hadijah & Shalawati, 2016; Loren, 2017). Listening skill is one of the important skills that must be mastered by students, the process of communication will effectively. Speaking skill conveys feelings, opinion, idea and desires to others (Sylvia, 2019). There are some factors contributing to speaking performance, namely fear of being wrong, shy, anxiety, and less confident (Lailiyah & Wulansari, 2017; (St, 2020;).

Speaking skill does not concern with correct sentence grammatically but also it covers field mechanics, functions, pragmatics, and interactions broad social network. Reading skill becomes a complicated skill since it requires understanding of context in particular text (Larasati & Nugroho, 2021). Students are asked to pay attention on the idea conveyed in the text. This skill helps students to obtain knowledge, information, new vocabulary, expressions, and terms (Mahsun & Koiriyah, 2019; Yunita et al., 2017). Moreover, this skill supports other language skills from the obtained vocabulary, grammar, and information in the text (Badrasawi et al.,

2017; Rosyidi & Darmanto, 2020). Thus, mastering reading skill supports other language skills.

Writing skill is a productive skill which involves cognitive processes in mastery knowledge through string of words symbolic or written (Rini & Cahyanto, 2020; Herman et al., 2020). A writing skill is the ability to establish communication in writing by producing something written in a visual way that everyone can read (Pradnyawathi & Gst, 2019). Writing abilities are also related to literacy skills as a measure of the output of the individual literacy process, which is outlined in various types of scientific, non-scientific, or literary works that are distinctive in their own right (Ranabumi et al., 2017).. Thus, writing abilities are the action of presenting words by producing something written in a visual form that everyone can read.

In order to acquire the language skills and the success of learning process, they are influenced by many factors (Suruni, 2018). One of them is the provision of learning materials (Kasdi and Wijayanti (2017). Innovative learning models will make learning more enjoyable and help students learn more effectively. In addition, it must be supported by learning materials. One of the most crucial aspects of learning is the learning materials (Hidayah & Priscylio, 2019; Herman et al., 2022). The learning materials can convey organized materials to be delivered to the students (Martha & Andini, 2019). Learning materials cover knowledge, skills, and attitudes that must be acquired by the students in order to achieve predetermined competency standards (Asriani et al., 2017). Moreover, learning materials can attract students' attention in learning because they have attractive designs and pictures (Gustiawati et al., 2020).

The quality of the learning materials depend on the the needs of students, curriculum demands, not dependent on textbooks and government aid packages,

and according to the characteristics of students (Andani & Yulian, 2018; Cloonan & Fingeret 2020; Weriyaniti et al., 2020). It can increase students' motivation and creativity to participate learning activities (Suzuki et al., 2020; Tsai et al., 2017). The quality of learning materials can be achieved by conducting learning materials development. Previous studies have proved the result of learning materials development. A study conducted by Makrifah & Widiarini, (2019) developed learning materials along with four language skills especially for tourism area. In addition, Verawati et al., (2019) also found that the developed learning materials were in line with BSNP (National Education Standards Agency). Moreover, a study done by Adi (2017) showed that developed learning materials give positive impact to the learning process.

However, the development of learning materials only concerns to the general English learning materials and language expression. The real problem was investigated in one of the universities in Bali, that is Universitas Hindu Negeri (UHN) I Gusti Bagus Sugriwa Denpasar. This university follow Hindu philosophy as the basis in the learning and teaching activity. Based on the preliminary observation, the students of UHN were taught general English by the lecturer. The learning materials did not cover the content of Hindu philosophy. In addition, prior analysis on the UHN curriculum identified a gap to the ministerial decree No.3/2020 and the specific content of learning English in the non-English departments at the university. Its English syllabus and course general outline had not been geared to achieve religious faith, character, personality, independence, and responsibility based on Hindu religion and philosophy. Moreover, English designed and developed in the syllabus and course basic outline did not meet the students' characteristics by making use of the underlying methodology and activities nested in the Hindu three-logy and philosophy (Doniger, 2009; Donder, 2020; Mortenson, 2022). It can be considered that the development of learning materials should consider its content which is in line with students' characteristics. This development can be done based on Content Language Integrated Learning.

Content Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) refers to an approach of language teaching used as a mean for teaching and learning about linguistics content and language relevant additions. CLIL focuses on two aspects, namely language and content (Merino & Lasagabaster, 2018). It is seen as an approach to didactic innovation and transdisciplinary collaboration by many educators (Tagnin & Ní Riordáin, 2021). It strongly demands group and student-centered learning (Nurkhin, 2014). Moreover, it is a complex learning approach, where learning will provide (a) children's educational experience when the quality of the subject is emphasized more than the words used; (b) context in language teaching and thus is more important for children; (c) inspiring and offers wider opportunities for a wider range of learners; (d) exposure to foreign languages naturally; and (e) sufficient time during learning and teaching process (Setyaningrum et al. al., 2020). The existence of CLIL gives many impacts to development language participant because it is proven effective in western countries in increase ability language participant

students. Furthermore, this approach helps students to speed up development epistemological (Sarip, 2019) . Thus, it can be said that the presence of CLIL gives positive impact on language learning.

Some previous researchers had done investigation on the use of CLIL. The existence of CLIL will have many impacts on the language of students, according with Deswila's research that CLIL is effectively in western countries in improving students' language skills (Deswila et al., 2020). Furthermore, this approach helps students to speed up development epistemological (Sarip, 2019) . Thus, it can be said that the presence of CLIL gives positive impact on language learning. A study conducted by Sumartana et al., (2019) showed that CLIL model was implemented in the Engineering Class Mechanics. The result of the study showed that the achievement of students increased by 17.16% of students who were taught by conventional methods. The developed materials could attract students' attention in the learning process. learning materials based on Content Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) in vocational schools. The learning materials consisted of local culture wisdom of Kediri region, East Java through Panji Stories. The feasibility of the product was assessed by literature experts, literature teachers, and vocational students. The evaluation consisted of component content, systematic presentation, variety of discussion, and the display of product. The result of the study showed that the product was feasible to be implemented for learning Indonesian. In addition, the use of CLIL in developing learning material gave positive impact for students, teacher, learning model, and curriculum (Momang, 2018). The implementation of CLIL in SD Laboratory, State University of Malang shows that teachers in teach mathematics subject in English, and combined in Indonesian. The student more understanding math that taught in English (Kamumu, 2020). learning accountancy through CLIL strategy could increase students' achievement. The study was designed in classroom action research. The result of the study showed that the results of the posttest results in the first and second cycles were higher compared to the results of pretest (Nurkhin, 2014).

This study aims to analyze the effectiveness of CLIL-based English Learning Materials for Hindu Education Department Students in Hindu Universities. The novelty of this study is combining English learning materials with CLIL approach. Both components are being developed partially and currently there is no research that has conducted the development of CLIL-based teaching materials in Hindu philosophy written in English.

Method

This research was designed using a model development of ADDIE Model. ADDIE' s model involves five systematic steps. The first step was Analyze. In this step, the analysis of students need was identified. There was no Hindu developed learning materials during learning process for Hindu Universities. The content of learning materials needed to be in line with students' background. In addition, the interview guide was conducted to find the needs of the students. The second step was Design. In this step, the needed

learning materials were designed. In this case, the learning materials were designed in the form of E-book in which can be used in online and offline learning. In addition, the E-book was designed based on the CLIL approach considering the 4C components including content, cognition, communication, and culture. In addition, the learning materials were designed into several units covering integrated language skills in each activity.

The third step was Develop. In this step, the planned learning materials were developed into E-book. The book consisted of the component of CLIL and integrated language skills. In addition, in this development stage, the quality of the product was also tested by involving students, lecturers, and expert to validate the quality of the product. The fourth step was Implement. In this step, the developed learning materials were implemented to the Hindu Universities in Bali. There were only three sub units of the materials were implemented to all universities. The last step was Evaluate. In this step, the effectiveness of the learning materials was tested. The results of the students' pretest and posttest were collected to find out the effectiveness of the developed product.

Research subject consists of 73 people in total who were recruited for the following purposes. 1) The students' needs of CLIL-based English learning materials for Hindu Education Department in Hindu Universities involved religion experts and English lecturers. 2) the procedure of CLIL-based English learning materials developed for Hindu Education Department in Hindu Universities involved the researcher in this study. 3) The quality of the developed CLIL-based English learning materials for Hindu Education Department in Hindu Universities involved students who register in English subject, lecturer, and material experts. 4) The effectiveness of the developed CLIL-based English learning materials for Hindu Education Department in Hindu Universities involved students at UHN Denpasar, UNHI, STAHN Mpu Kuturan Singaraja, STKIP Agama Hindu Singaraja, dan STKIP Agama Hindu Amlapura.

The data were carried out using two analytical techniques (combination methods), namely descriptive and inferential data analysis (Sugiyono, 2017). The results of a limited area test (preliminary field testing) employing experimental and qualitative methods using a test instrument. The data from the limited trial were then evaluated, and the findings were used to inform product revision. The revised product is finally put to the test in the main field (main field testing). At the main field testing stage, 30-100 people can be used (Sugiyono, 2015). The main field trials for this study were conducted in UHN Denpasar, UNHI, STAHN MPU Kuturan Singaraja, STKIP Hinduism Singaraja, and STKIP Hindu Religion Amlapura. While quantitative analysis techniques are data processing in the form of numbers or percentages, this technique is used to analyze the needs, validity, reliability, and effectiveness of the developed CLIL-based English learning materials for the Hindu Education Department. To obtain practical data were collected using an observation sheet for lecturers and students. Whereas, the product qualifies and receives a minimum score of 80%, it fulfills the qualifying criteria. The product must be revised in accordance with the

validator's input, if the product does not reach the minimum score. The effectiveness of the product is carried out by comparing the present learning materials with CLIL-based English Learning Materials for the Hindu Education Department. The data related to effectiveness were analyzed quantitatively using descriptive statistics and inferential statistic involving paired sample T-test.

This research involved two phases of testing: the validity test and the practicality test. It was declared valid in the Very Valid category by the CLIL-based English Learning Materials Validity Test, with a score 1, it showed that each item was accepted and valid. From the result showed which was categorized into very good category. It indicated that the developed CLIL based English learning materials had a very good quality to be used by the lecturers in the learning process. And from the students also was categorized into very good category. It indicated that the developed CLIL based English learning materials had a very good quality to be used by the students in learning English based on Hindu philosophy.

Findings And Discussions

Findings

To find out the effectiveness of the product through implementation of CLIL-based English Learning materials was conducted at UHN Denpasar, UNHI, IHDN Mpu Kuturan Singaraja, STKIP Agama Hindu Singaraja, and STKIP Agama Hindu Amlapura. There were fifty students altogether recruited and were involved during the implementation or empirical evaluation. During implementations, the units were counter-balanced as follows, UHN, UNHI, STAHN Mpu Kuturan, STKIP Agama Hindu Singaraja and STKIP Agama Hindu Amlapura with Theme *Tattwa*, subtheme *Panca Sradha* and the topic *Brahman*; Theme *Susila, Tri Kaya Parisudha*, topic *Kayika Parisudha*; theme *Acara*, subtheme *Panca Yadnya, Dewa Yadnya*. Ten students were recruited for implementation at each university, and therefore, there were fifty students altogether. The session spanned for 100 minutes. The researcher herself implemented the learning materials with the assistance of an English lecturer as an observer.

The implementation covers the four language skills (reading, writing, listening, and speaking). Reading included skimming, reading comprehension and comprehension of research abstract; speaking included listening comprehension and discussion; writing included vocabulary and grammar. The implementation was carried out as if real teaching. It was started by explaining the learning outcomes and indicators in five minutes. The purposes were to get the students' attention, active participation as well as an apperception on forthcoming ELM-TSA. Then, the students were pleased to skim the texts in five minutes each text. After skimming the texts, they worked on texts' lexical items and gave referential meanings in English in ten minutes each text.

Reading comprehension followed with ten questions answered in ten minutes each text. Writing grammatical sentences using words or phrases in ten minutes each text. The students were also involved in providing the

Commented [W2]: this must be in simple past

Commented [W5]: lowercase

Commented [W3]: this one is clear and you explained of why there are 73 people and you explained clearly.

Commented [W6]: uppercase

Commented [W4]: you mentioned that there were 5 universities, but you didn't mention why they were taken as the data in your research. Please explain in order to given an outline to reader the importance of your research

Commented [W7]: how many researchers are there in here?

Commented [W8]: revise

Indonesian meanings of the afore-mentioned words or phrases in ten minutes each text. Finally, they discussed topics concerning *Tattwa, Susila, Acara* in twenty-five minutes for each speaking activity. The processes are reported per university and per unit activity as follows. These results indicate that the language skills of students taught by CLIL-based English learning materials have

improved language abilities than students taught with conventional devices. In order to check the effectiveness of the developed product, the analysis of test is carried out, namely: (1) normality test and (2) homogeneity tests. The normality of the data was tested. The normality can be seen in Table 1.

Table 1: Tests Of Normality

	Shapiro-Wilk Statistic	Df	Sig.
Pretest	0.087	50	0.205
Posttest	0.098	50	0.135

Table 1 showed that the sample of the study was 50 students. It indicated that the normality can be seen from Shapiro-Wilk test from its sig. value. Table 1 showed that the value of Shapiro-Wilk was 0.205 for pretest and 0.135

for posttest. These values were higher than 0.05 indicating that the data were distributed normally.

After conducting normality test, then, the data were tested its homogeneity as presented Table 2.

Table 2: Test Of Homogeneity Of Variance

		Levene Statistic	df1	df2	Sig.
Result	Based on Mean	2.545	1	98	0.114
	Based on Median	1.624	1	98	0.206
	Based on Median and with adjusted df	1.624	1	95.131	0.206
	Based on trimmed mean	2.547	1	98	0.114

Table 2 showed that the value significant value of based on mean was 0.114 that was higher than 0.050. This value indicated that the data were homogeneous. After finding out the normality and homogeneity, then, the

paired sample t-test was done to see its effectiveness on every Hindu university. The results of the learning materials effectiveness can be seen in Table 3.

Table 3: Paired Samples Test

	Paired Differences		Std. Error Mean	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference		t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)	
	Mean	Std. Deviation		Lower	Upper				
Pair 1	Pre-test	-10.96	5.329	1.685	-14.772	-7.147	-6.442	9	0.001
	Post-test								

Discussions

In the discussion, discuss related to the learning materials developed by the researcher. The results of the CLIL-based English Learning Materials Needs Analysis show that these learning materials are needed to improve the language skills of students in Hindu Department. CLIL-based English Learning Materials, certainly make the learning process more interesting. It is because learning materials is one of the important factors in learning learning process (Hidayah & Priscylio, 2019). Learning materials creates an effective communication for students (Martha & Andini, 2019). Learning materials cover the knowledge, skills, and attitudes that must be learned in order to achieve the standards competency (Asriani et al., 2017). In addition, the provision of learning materials can attract students' attention in the learning process because they have attractive designs and content (Gustiawati et al., 2020).

The importance of learning materials in the learning process requires the lecturers to develop learning

materials with the needs of students, and the characteristics of students (Andani & Yulian, 2018; Cloonan & Fingeret, 2020; Weriyaniti et al., 2020). Learning materials covering needs, and characteristics will be able to increase the motivation of students (Suzuki et al., 2020). In addition, it can also increase the creativity of students (Tsai et al., 2017). The presence of qualified learning materials will be able to have an impact on motivation, interest, and creativity, which result in student learning outcomes. Moreover, the existence of appropriate learning materials will have an impact on the skills of students. Based on these statements, it is needed to prepare learning materials according to the characteristics of students. The validity of learning materials by testing content validity, conducted by two experts, the content validity coefficient is 1. These results indicate that the content validity of learning materials is valid category. Whereas, the coefficient of the Content Validity Index of learning materials is 1 referring to the quality of good category. The validity of the assessment

Commented [W9]: lowercase

Commented [W10]: lowercase

Commented [W11]: lowercase

Commented [W12]: Before section of Discussion, you should provide and explain the results of your research paper. You just mentioned the table with the analysis but without clear results.

Commented [W13]: check

of learning materials given by five English lecturers and ten students as users review, was very good category.

Based on expert and user reviews of the learning materials that have been carried out, it can be concluded that the learning materials that have been developed are qualifying to implement to the Hindu Universities in Bali. The process of developing learning materials is based on the results of the needs. In developing learning materials, the first is to conduct a needs analysis to gain the characteristics of students and content of material to be developed. The learning materials by the needs of students and the environment of students (Mayarnimar & Taufina, 2017; Weriyaniti et al., 2020). The Learning materials meet specific needs of the students by making use of the underlying methodology and activities nested in the Hindu three-logy and philosophy (Doniger, 2009; Donder, 2020; Mortenson, 2022). Learning materials material was valid if related to the material requirements, easy to understand the language, and in accordance with the student's character and are attractive (Irman & Waskito, 2020; Lestar, 2021). Learning materials have good content feasibility, language, and attractive designs can help students understand the material (Estuwardani & Mustadi, 2016) and encouraging students to learn more actively and independently (Yati & Amini, 2020). Simply concluded that the development of learning materials must be adapted to the characteristics of students as well as current conditions. The characteristics of students are needed to help develop designs that are in accordance with the characteristics of students who require students to learn independently.

In the analysis of the quality of learning materials was very good quality. The learning materials are designed with instructions clearly will making the students easier to learn. The results showed that the CLIL-based learning materials can effectively improve language skills. Can be seen from the difference in the mean of pretest and posttest. The teaching learning process with CLIL-based Learning Materials is conducted with materials that relevant with the needs of students. The learning materials makes lecturer be able to conduct material well to students (Martha & Andini, 2019). Learning materials are knowledge, skills, and attitudes that must be learned in order to achieve the standards competency (Asriani et al., 2017), and learning materials can attract students' attention in learning because they have attractive designs and pictures (Gustiawati et al., 2020). The importance of learning materials in the learning process requires lecturers to develop learning materials that are in accordance with the needs of students (Andani & Yulian, 2018; Cloonan & Fingeret, 2020; Weriyaniti et al., 2020). CLIL-based learning materials give room for acquisition of language skills and knowledge on the Hindu *Tattwa, Susila, Acara* for development of self-confidence and self-actualization. And enhance lecturers and students to participate actively and effectively in each unit.

CLIL-based English learning materials have a positive impact on students' language skills, with the various skills, including reading, writing, speaking listening, and linguistic aspects such as lexical items, grammar, and word meaning (Susanti, 2019). The integrated language features and skills are be able to achieve the goal of learning language which is the target

language communicatively. All of these aspects are taught in an integrated manner to be able to achieve the goal of language learning, which is to make students able to use the target language, in this case English, communicatively (Santosa, 2017).

Listening skill is determined to be a major component in language learning (Wulandari & Sya'ya, 2021). Listening involves the process of hearing from what speakers say (receptive orientation); construct and reflect on meaning (constructive orientation); negotiate meaning with the speaker and react (collaborative orientation); and generate meaning through interaction, creativity, and empathy (transformative orientation). This skill can be developed through a strategy which requires students to have listening tasks as well as practices (Syahabuddin & Rizqa, 2021). Lack of listening skill will impact to communication in which the message of communication cannot be received (Hadijah & Shalawati, 2016). Listening are classified into three categories: pre-listening, while-listening, and post-listening activities (Khan & Karim, 2014).

The ability to speak is the most essential skill since it is the basic for communication and speaking is a skill for people who want to be a competence in foreign language. Speaking skill does not concern with correct sentence grammatically but also it covers field mechanics, functions, pragmatics, and interactions broad social network (Kurum, 2016). In addition, it also conveys hopes, need feelings, opinion, idea and desires to others (Sylvia, 2019). It is the means through which learners can communicate with others to achieve certain goals or to express their opinions, intentions, and viewpoints (St, 2020). There are some factors contributing to speaking performance, namely fear of being (1) wrong, it means that students are afraid to make mistakes in expressing their opinions or ideas. (2) shy, means the emotional nature when the students asked to speak, (3) anxiety, anxiety is feeling of tension, apprehension, nervousness and worry, this condition arises in speaking performance when students are asked to speak their opinion. and (4) less confident, is a common feeling that occurs when students express their ideas and their friends would not understand them. (Lailiyah & Wulansari, 2017). These factors influence students' performance in speaking when they cannot handle them. The way to handle these factors by keeping speaking practice.

Reading skill becomes a complicated skill since it requires understanding of context in particular text (Larasati & Nugroho, 2021). The students can enlarge their knowledge in reading activity Yunita et al., 2017). Students are asked to pay attention on the idea conveyed in the text. This skill helps students to obtain knowledge, information, new vocabulary, expressions, and terms (Mahsun & Koiriyah, 2019). Moreover, this skill supports other language skills from the obtained vocabulary, grammar, and information in the text Rosyidi & Darmanto, 2020). Thus, mastering reading skill supports other language skills (Badrasawi et al., 2017). So, reading skills are important for learning because reading can gain knowledge, information and improved vocabulary, expressions and terms students to support their writing, speaking, and listening skills.

Commented [W14]: grammatical error

Writing skill is a productive skill which involves cognitive processes in mastery knowledge through string of words symbolic or written (Rini & Cahyanto, 2020). Writing ability is the ability to communicate in writing by producing anything written in a visual form that can be read (Pradnyawathi & Gst, 2019). It concerns to sentence formation. There are four level that should be experienced by students from simple to complex one, namely imitative, intensive, responsive, and extensive writing. These levels guide students to start their writing from simple activities to complex one. In addition, this skill demands knowledge and skill (Ranabumi et al., 2017). It indicates that students are required to have idea in showing their skills. The quality of the learning materials depend on the the needs of students, curriculum demands, not dependent on textbooks and government aid packages, and according to the characteristics of students (Andani & Yulian, 2018; Cloonan & Fingeret 2020; Weriyaniti et al., 2020). It can increase students' motivation and creativity to participate learning activities (Suzuki et al., 2020; Tsai et al., 2017). It can be considered that the development of learning materials should consider its content which is in line with students' characteristics. This development can be done based on *Content Language Integrated Learning*.

Content Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) refers to a variety of language teaching methodologies used to teach and learn both non-content linguistics (NLC) and languages. CLIL is a dual-focus educational approach in which integrated languages are used for the learning and teaching of content and language. It does not focus on topic or language in the teaching and learning process but also the content itself (Merino & Lasagabaster, 2018). Some educators use CLIL as a method of pedagogical innovation and cross-disciplinary collaboration (Tagnin & Ni Riordáin, 2021). CLIL is a student-centered method that necessitates group learning (Nurkhin, 2014). Learning with this approach will provide (a) children's educational experience increases when the quality of the subject is emphasized more than the words used; (b) language is taught in context and thus is more important for children; (c) CLIL is more inspiring and offers wider opportunities for a wider range of learners; (d) it gives students more exposure to foreign languages naturally; and (e) it does not require additional time (Setyaningrum et al., 2020).

The development of the CLIL-based English Learning Materials for Hindu Education Department Students in Hindu Universities is based on the advantages of learning materials and CLIL. The difference between this research and previous research is many of the research does not combine English learning materials with the CLIL approach. In this research, focus to facilitate contextual learning through CLIL-based learning material. Contextual learning would assist students in identifying their real interests in English and the Hindu religion as well. Students would be more likely interested in learning English associated closely with the Hindu religion and philosophy (Hidayah & Priscylio, 2019). Integrating the English language aspects and the Hindu three-logy theme and sub-theme as to activate the students' listening, speaking, reading and writing skills through a theme-based, text-based, word-based,

grammar-based, and meaning based learning models. model that could make the English learning and activity more interesting, practical, realistic and appealing

Conclusions

CLIL-based teaching materials effectively improve students' learning outcomes and language skills. Therefore, the CLIL-based English learning materials are effective to use in learning process. The result showed that the CLIL based English Learning Materials were valid, practical and effective, it seen in the average score of post-tests higher than the pre-test of students who were taught conventional materials. Considering the importance of mastering English and the students' subject of study, the researcher recommendation to implement and create CLIL-based English learning material.

References

- Alzieni, H. (2021). The Impact of Mobile-Assisted Language Learning (MALL) in Developing the Listening Skill: A Case of Students at Dubai Men's College, the United Arab Emirates. *Arab World English Journal*, 2, 84–95. <https://doi.org/10.24093/awej/mec2.6>.
- Amalia, F., Putri, B., & Rezkita, S. (2019). Pengembangan Media Pembelajaran IPA Berbasis Powerpoint Interaktif untuk Siswa Kelas V Sekolah Dasar Negeri Gondolayu. *Trihayu: Jurnal Pendidikan Ke-SD-An*, 5(3), 684–693. <https://doi.org/10.30738/trihayu.v5i3.6122>.
- Andani, D. T., & Yulian, M. (2018). Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Electronic Book Menggunakan Software Kvisoft Flipbook Pada Materi Hukum Dasar Kimia di SMA Negeri 1 Pantan Reu Aceh Barat. *Jurnal IPA & Pembelajaran IPA*, 2(1), 1–6. <https://doi.org/10.24815/jipi.v2i1.10730>.
- Asriani, P., Sa'dijah, C., & Akbar, S. (2017). Bahan Ajar Berbasis Pendidikan Karakter Untuk Siswa KELAS IV Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Pendidikan: Teori, Penelitian, Dan Pengembangan*, 2(11), 1456–1468. <https://doi.org/10.17977/jptpp.v2i11.10160>.
- Badrasawi, K. J. I., Kassim, N. L. A., & Mat Daud, N. (2017). The effects of test characteristics on the hierarchical order of reading skills. *Malaysian Journal of Learning and Instruction*, 14(1), 63–82. <https://doi.org/10.32890/mjli2017.14.1.3>.
- Cloonan, M., & Fingeret, A. L. (2020). Developing teaching materials for learners in surgery. *Surgery (United States)*, 167(4), 689–692. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.surg.2019.05.056>.
- Crain, W. (2007). *Teori Perkembangan Konsep dan Aplikasi*. Pustaka Pelajar.
- Deswila, N., Kustati, M., Besral, B., & Sukandi, S. S. (2020). Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) Approach across Curriculum in Science Classrooms: Are the English Language Use and Learning Reveal? *Journal of Innovation in Educational and Cultural Research*, 1(1), 15–21. <https://doi.org/10.46843/jiecr.v1i1.4>.
- Dewi, A., Dewi, L., & Setiawati, L. (2018). Efektivitas Penggunaan Media Gambar Karikatur Terhadap Peningkatan Motivasi Belajar Siswa Pada Mata Pelajaran Sejarah. *Educehnologia*, 2(1), 1–12. <https://ejournal.upi.edu/index.php/edutechnologia/article/view/19654/10072>.
- Dewi, T. K., & Yuliana, R. (2018). Pengembangan Media Pembelajaran Scrapbook Materi Karangan Deskripsi Mata Pelajaran Bahasa Indonesia Kelas Iii Sekolah Dasar.

Commented [W15]: Your conclusion is just a repetition from the findings. Please provide a conclusion as whole from your research paper

Commented [W16]: check

- Refleksi Edukatika: Jurnal Ilmiah Kependidikan*, 9(1). <https://doi.org/10.24176/re.v9i1.2804>.
- Elfiona, E., Zaim, M., & Refnaldi. (2019). Mobile-Based Media as the Solution in Teaching and Learning Listening Skill. *Journal of Physics: Conference Series*, 1387(1). <https://doi.org/10.1088/1742-6596/1387/1/012024>.
- Estuwardani, N. A., & Mustadi, A. (2016). Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Modul Tematik-Integratif Dalam Peningkatan Karakter Peserta Didik Kelas I Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Pendidikan Karakter*, 0(2), 157–172. <https://doi.org/10.21831/jpk.v0i2.8620>.
- Firdaus, & Mukhaiyar, R. (2021). Buku Ajar Berbasis Masalah untuk Mata Pelajaran Dasar Listrik dan Elektronika di SMK. *Jurnal Pedagogi Dan Pembelajaran*, 4(1), 192–201. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jp2.v4i1.32394>.
- Gustiawati, R., Arief, D., & Zikri, A. (2020). Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Membaca Permulaan dengan Menggunakan Cerita Fabel pada Siswa Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Basicedu*, 4(2), 355–360. <https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v4i2.339>.
- Hadjiah, S., & Shalawati. (2016). A Study on Listening Skills and Perspective to First Year Students at English Department of Academic Year 2015/2016. *J-SHMIC*, 30(2), 2016. [https://doi.org/10.25299/jshmic.2016.vol3\(2\).527](https://doi.org/10.25299/jshmic.2016.vol3(2).527).
- Herman., Purba, R., Thao, N. V., & Purba, A. (2020). Using Genre-based Approach to Overcome Students' Difficulties in Writing. *Journal of Education and E-Learning Research*, 7(4), 464-470. <https://doi.org/10.20448/journal.509.2020.74.464.470>
- Herman, H., Shara, A. M., Silalahi, T. F., Sheryly, S., and Julyanthry, J. (2022). Teachers' Attitude towards Minimum Competency Assessment at Sultan Agung Senior High School in Pematangsiantar, Indonesia. *Journal of Curriculum and Teaching*, Vol. 11, No. 2, PP. 01-14. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5430/jct.v11n2p1>
- Hidayah, D. N., & Priscylio, G. (2019). Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Mandiri Pokok Bahasan Suhu Dan Kalor Menggunakan Software Camtasia. *Journal of Teaching and Learning Physics*, 4(1), 50–64. <https://doi.org/10.15575/jotalp.v4i1.4093>.
- Irman, S., & Waskito, W. (2020). Validasi Modul Berbasis Project Based Learning pada Mata Pelajaran Simulasi dan Komunikasi Digital. *Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan Dan Pembelajaran*, 4(2), 260–269. <https://ejournal.undiksha.ac.id/index.php/JIPP/article/download/26156/15794>.
- Kaharuddin, N. (2017). The Problems of Indonesian College Efl Learners in Listening Comprehension. *Jurnal Ilmu Budaya*, 1997, 386.
- Kamumu, N. (2020). Implementasi content and language integrated learning (CLIL) dalam pembelajaran bahasa lintas kurikulum. *Seminar Nasional Pendidikan, FKIP UNIPMA 2020*, 2(Cilil), 750–757. <https://prosiding.unma.ac.id/index.php/semnasfkip/article/view/370>.
- Kasdi, K., & Wijayanti, D. N. (2017). Pembelajaran Bahasa Inggris Efektif Melalui Lagu Anak-Anak Untuk Siswa Madrasah Ibtidaiyah. *Elementary*, 4(1). <https://doi.org/10.21043/elementary.v4i1.1931>.
- Khan, I. U., & Karim, A. (2014). Strategies for improving English language listening skill (The case of distract BANNU). *Research on Humanities and Social Sciences*, 4(7), 37–49.
- Kurum, E. Y. (2016). Teaching Speaking Skills. *Research Gate*, 25(1), 264–273. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/312538107_Teaching_Speaking_Skills.
- Lailiyah, N., & Wulansari, W. (2017). Peningkatan Keterampilan Berbicara Melalui Metode Diskusi Kelompok Model Tanam Paksa Siswa Kelas X Pemasaran 1 SMK PGRI 2 Kediri. *Jurnal Pendidikan (Teori Dan Praktik)*, 1(2), 166. <https://doi.org/10.26740/jp.v1n2.p166-173>.
- Larasati, A. S., & Nugroho, M. A. (2021). Teaching Methods for Reading Skill in Inclusive Class. *Ethical Lingua*, 8(1), 285–291. <https://ethicallingua.org/25409190/article/view/272>
- Lestar, W. (2021). Pengembangan Modul Pembelajaran Bahasa Inggris Berbasis Andragogi Pada Program Studi Pendidikan Biologi di Universitas Muhammadiyah Palembang. *Edunesia: Jurnal Ilmiah Pendidikan*, 2(1), 171–177. <https://edunesia.org/index.php/edu/article/download/114/47>.
- Loren, F. T. A. (2017). The Use of Learning Media on Listening Skill in Teaching Indonesian To Speakers of Other Language (Tisol). *Lingua Didaktika: Jurnal Bahasa Dan Pembelajaran Bahasa*, 11(1), 1. <https://doi.org/10.24036/ld.v11i1.7625>.
- Mahsun, M., & Koiriyah, M. (2019). Meningkatkan Keterampilan Membaca melalui Media Big Book pada Siswa Kelas IA MI Nurul Islam Kalibendo Pasirian Lumajang. *Bidayatuna: Jurnal Pendidikan Guru Mandrasah Ibtidaiyah*, 2(1), 60. <https://doi.org/10.36835/bidayatuna.v2i1.361>.
- Martha, N. U., & Andini, N. P. (2019). Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Mata Pelajaran Bahasa Indonesia Berbasis Cerita Rakyat Kabupaten Banjarnegara. *JINOP*, 5(2), 185–197. <https://doi.org/10.22219/jinop.v5i2.9992>.
- Mayarnimar, & Taufina. (2017). *Validity Analysis of the VARK (Visual, Auditory, Read-Write, and Kinesthetic) Model - Based Basic Reading and Writing Instructional Materials for the 1st Grade Students of Elementary School*. 118, 870–874. <https://doi.org/10.2991/icset-17.2017.141>.
- Merino, J. A., & Lasagabaster, D. (2018). The effect of content and language integrated learning programmes' intensity on English proficiency: A longitudinal study. *International Journal of Applied Linguistics (United Kingdom)*, 28(1), 18–30. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ijal.12177>
- Momang, H. D. (2018). Content Language Integrated Learning dan Implementasinya Dalam Pembelajaran BIPA. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa, Sastra, Dan Budaya*, 1(2), 131–140. <http://jurnal.unikastpaulus.ac.id/index.php/jpro/article/view/522/319>.
- Nurjannah. (2018). Pengaruh Media Gambar Terhadap Motivasi Belajar Pelajaran Bahasa Indonesia Kelas Iii Sdn Pasi Pinang. *Bina Gogik*, 5(1), 71–78. <https://ejournal.stkipbbm.ac.id/index.php/pgsd/article/view/17>.
- Nurkhin, A. (2014). Strategi Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) untuk Meningkatkan Kualitas Pembelajaran Akuntansi Biaya. *Dinamika Pendidikan*, 1X(2), 130–147.
- Pradnyawathi, N. N. C., & Gst, N. S. A. (2019). Pengaruh Model Pakem Berbasis Tri Hita Karana terhadap Keterampilan Menulis. *International Journal of Elementary Education*, 3(1), 89. <https://doi.org/10.23887/ijec.v3i1.17660>.
- Pratiwi, P. H., Nur, H., & Martiana, A. (2017). Pengembangan Modul Mata Kuliah Penilaian Pembelajaran Sosiologi Berorientasi Hots. *Jurnal Cakrawala Pendidikan*, 36(2), 201–209. <https://doi.org/10.21831/cp.v36i2.13123>.
- Ranabumi, R., Rohmadi, M., & Subiyantoro, S. (2017). Improving Students' Writing Short Story Skill through Time Token Learning and Video Media. *Journal of Education and Learning (EduLearn)*, 11(4), 439–445. <https://doi.org/10.11591/edulearn.v11i4.6808>.
- Rini, T. A., & Cahyanto, B. (2020). Supporting Elementary Students Creative Writing Skill With Assessment as Learning. *Education and Humanities Research*, 487(Ecpe), 51–57. <https://doi.org/10.2991/assehr.k.201112.010>.

- Riwu, I. U., Laksana, D. N. L., & Dhiu, K. D. (2018). Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Elektronik Bermuatan Multimedia Pada Tema Peduli Terhadap Makhluk Hidup Untuk Siswa Sekolah Dasar Kelas Iv Di Kabupaten Ngada. *Journal of Education Technology*, 2(2), 56. <https://doi.org/10.23887/jet.v2i2.16182>.
- Rosyidi, A. Z., & Darmanto, D. (2020). a Study on Students' Ability in Reading Descriptive Text; a Case Study At Sman 1 Sikur. *Journal of Languages and Language Teaching*, 8(3), 330. <https://doi.org/10.33394/jollt.v8i3.2723>.
- Santosa, P. P. P. (2017). Kemampuan Membaca Teks Persuasif Bahasa Inggris Siswa Kelas X SMK Negeri 2 Depok (The ability to read Text United Kingdom Language Grade Persuasive X SMK Negeri 2). *Deiksis*, 09(02), 170–181. <https://journal.lppmunindra.ac.id/index.php/Deiksis/article/view/1172>.
- Sarip, M. (2019). Model of Content and Language Integrated Learning (Clil) Strategy in Arabic Speaking Subject. *Arabiyat: Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Arab Dan Kebahasaaraban*, 6(1), 53–70. <https://doi.org/10.15408/a.v6i1.10371>.
- Setyaningrum, R. W., Setiawan, S., Anam, S., & Retnaningdyah, P. (2020). Content and language integrated learning (clil) in science class during covid-19 outbreak: a narrative inquiry. *English Review: Journal of English Education*, 9(1), 35–46. <https://www.journal.uniku.ac.id/index.php/ERJE/article/view/3777>.
- St, W. Z. (2020). Peningkatan Keterampilan Berbicara melalui Metode Bercerita Siswa Kelas III SD Negeri 1 Beringin Jaya Kecamatan Bumi Raya Kabupaten Morowali. *Jurnal Studi Guru Dan Pembelajaran*, 3(1), 148–156. <https://doi.org/10.30605/jsgp.3.1.2020.249>.
- Sugiyono. (2015). *Metode Penelitian dan Pengembangan (Research and Development/ R&D)*. Alfabeta.
- Sugiyono. (2017). *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Sumartana, M., Sadiyah, W., Widanta, R. J., Ardika, D., Sitawati, R., & Suciani, K. (2019). *Effectiveness of Content-Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) Toward Students' English Competence*. 354(iCASTSS), 383–386. <https://doi.org/10.2991/icastss-19.2019.81>.
- Suruni. (2018). Peningkatan Prestasi Belajar Bahasa Inggris melalui Metode Mind Mapping di MAN I Gunungkidul. *Jurnal Pendidikan Madrasah, Volume*, 3(1), 77–87. <http://ejournal.stital.ac.id/index.php/alibrah/article/download/45/38>.
- Susanti, L. M. A. (2019). Membangun Keterampilan Literasi Berbasis Character Values Melalui Balinese Folklore Berbantuan Media Call Sebagai Upaya Peningkatan Kemampuan Bahasa Inggris Siswa Kelas V SD N 1 & 2 Paket Agung. *Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris Undiksha*, 7(1), 67–77. <https://ejournal.undiksha.ac.id/index.php/JPBI/article/view/31967>.
- Suzuki, S. N., Akimoto, Y., Suzuki, K., Okada, A., Hirata, K., Kato, T., Yajima, K., Kanematsu, H., Fukumoto, T., & Yoshikawa, F. (2020). Development of A-txt system compatible introductory teaching materials for Electric Power Engineering using gaming simulation. *Procedia Computer Science*, 176, 1557–1566. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.procs.2020.09.167>.
- Syafii. (2017). Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Omamen Berbasis Candi di Jawa Tengah: Studi Identifikasi Candi Gedongsanga. *Jurnal Imajinasi*, XI(2), 117–124. <https://doi.org/10.15294/imajinasi.v11i2.12813>.
- Syahabuddin, K., & Rizqa, K. (2021). Improving Students' Listening Skill Using Podcasts. *Journal of Digital Education, Communication, and Arts (Deca)*, 4(01), 51–61. <https://doi.org/10.30871/deca.v4i01.2867>.
- Sylvia, R. I. (2019). Analisis Keterampilan Berbicara Berbasis Paired Storytelling (Bercerita Berpasangan) Pada Tema Lingkungan Sahabat Kita Siswa Kelas V Sd Negeri 2 Mojoarum Tahun Ajaran 2018/2019. *Jurnal Pena SD*, 05(1), 31–35. <https://doi.org/10.29100/jpsd.v5i1.1534>.
- Tagnin, L., & Ni Riordáin, M. (2021). Building science through questions in Content and Language Integrated Learning (CLIL) classrooms. *International Journal of STEM Education*, 8(1). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40594-021-00293-0>.
- Tsai, H. C., Jou, M., Wang, J. Y., & Huang, C. C. (2017). An empirical study on the incorporation of APP and progressive reasoning teaching materials for improving technical creativity amongst students in the subject of automatic control. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 75, 997–1007. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chb.2016.10.031>.
- Weriyantri, W., Firman, F., Taufina, T., Taufina, T., & Zikri, A. (2020). Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Tematik Terpadu dengan Strategi Question Student Have di Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Basicedu*, 4(2), 476–483. <https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v4i2.374>.
- Wulandari, T., & Sya'ya, N. (2021). The Effectiveness Of Students' Listening Skill By Using Podcast The Effectiveness Of Students' Listening Skill By Using Podcast At The Second Grade Of Smk Negeri 6 Balikpapan. *Borneo Journal of Language and Education*, 1(1), 2021. <https://journal.uinsi.ac.id/index.php/bjle/article/view/3134>.
- Yati, W., & Amini, R. (2020). Pengembangan Bahan Ajar Dengan Pendekatan Cooperative Learning Tipe Turnamen Pada Siswa Kelas IV SD. *Jurnal Basicedu*, 4(1), 158–167. <https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v4i1.335>.
- Yunita, Y., Fitri, F., & Zulfahita, Z. (2017). Peningkatan Keterampilan Membaca Ekstensif Menggunakan Model Pembelajaran Reciprocal Teaching pada Siswa Kelas VIII D MTs Negeri Singkawang Tahun Ajaran 2016/2017. *JP-BSI (Jurnal Pendidikan Bahasa Dan Sastra Indonesia)*, 2(1), 12. <https://doi.org/10.26737/jp-bsi.v2i1.231>.